CVE Board Meeting Notes
August 3, 2022 (9:00 am – 11:00 am ET)

CVE Board Attendance
☐ Ken Armstrong, EWA-Canada, An Intertek Company
☒ Tod Beardsley, Rapid7
☒ Chris Coffin (MITRE At-Large), The MITRE Corporation
☐ Jessica Colvin
☒ Mark Cox, Red Hat, Inc.
☒ William Cox, Synopsys, Inc.
☒ Patrick Emsweller, Cisco Systems, Inc.
☐ Jay Gazlay, Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA)
☐ Tim Keanini, Cisco Systems, Inc.
☒ Kent Landfield, Trellix
☒ Scott Lawler, LP3
☒ Chris Levendis (MITRE, Board Moderator)
☒ Art Manion, CERT/CC (Software Engineering Institute, Carnegie Mellon University)
☐ Pascal Meunier, CERIAS/Purdue University
☒ Tom Millar, Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA)
☐ Tim Munro, Pen Test Partners LLP
☐ Chandan Nandakumaraiah, Palo Alto Networks
☒ Kathleen Noble, Intel Corporation
☒ Lisa Olson, Microsoft
☒ Shannon Sabens, CrowdStrike
☐ Takayuki Uchiyama, Panasonic Corporation
☒ David Waltermire, National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST)
☐ James “Ken” Williams, Broadcom Inc.

MITRE CVE Team Attendance
☒ Kris Britton
☒ Christine Deal
☒ Dave Morse
☒ Art Rich
Agenda

- 9:00-9:05  Introduction
- 9:05-10:35  Topics
  - Working Group Updates (WG Chairs)
  - CVE Board Meeting Attendance (Mark Cox)
  - Status of WG Operations Handbook (Dave Morse)
  - Lunch at Black Hat (Shannon Sabens)
  - Open Discussion
- 10:35-10:55  Review of Action Items
- 10:55-11:00  Closing Remarks

New Action Items from Today’s Meeting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action Item #</th>
<th>New Action Item</th>
<th>Responsible Party</th>
<th>Due</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08.03.01</td>
<td>Look into the rationale for why issues 787 and 559 are listed as low priority (meaning they can wait until after soft deploy), and report back to the Board.</td>
<td>Kris</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08.03.02</td>
<td>Reach out to Board members individually with poor meeting attendance/program engagement to discuss how to get more participation. Present results to the Board.</td>
<td>Program Coordination Team</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08.03.03</td>
<td>Survey the Board about ways to improve Board meetings and to foster more engagement. Tom Millar can help with survey design/review.</td>
<td>Secretariat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Working Group Updates

- Automation Working Group (AWG) (Kris Britton)
  - CVE Services 2.1 community penetration testing (round II) ended July 29. It was performed by six volunteer CNAs. Final test reports are due August 5. Informal reports so far indicate no exploitable vulnerabilities identified.
  - Secretariat ad-hoc testing continues. The internal secure code review is complete (some recommendations have been provided, and no exploitable vulnerabilities have been identified). Performance testing is running through August 2022.
  - Development team is working on high priority issues and adjudicating incoming issues. As of August 3, there are five high priority issues in the backlog. High priority issues must be addressed prior to soft deploy. Low priority issues will be handled prior to hard deploy.
Client engagement includes three recommended clients for CVE Services 2.1/JSON 5: Vulnogram, RedHat cvelib, CERT/CC cveClient. Testing of basic functionality of the three clients ended June 29. Two testing volunteers have reported on Vulnogram and cveClient, with no CVE Services issues identified. The third volunteer has requested more time (for RedHat cvelib); expects to complete in August.

Current Soft Deploy Scorecard results were shared. Color coding meanings are: green (complete), orange (in progress), black (not started). An important activity in progress is the Security Architecture/Threat Model Review (i.e., Red Hat threat model review).

A member of the Board mentioned a concern about issues 787 and 559 being currently listed as low priority. **Action item:** Kris will look into the rationale of why these two issues were ranked low priority (meaning they can wait until after soft deploy), and report back to the Board.

Next steps: Final penetration testing results (August 5), receive interim results of performance testing, adjudicate/prioritize results, present test results to TWG the week of August 15 for their thoughts on timing of CVE Services 2.1 deployment and the workshop.

For CVE Program website development, work is going well. JSON 5.0 rendering is 95% complete. No issues expected for soft deploy.

Other AWG activities include continued issue identification/resolution, and starting to think past soft deploy, e.g., CVE List Bulk Download Requirements/Architecture draft (for hard deploy).

- **CNA Coordination Working Group (CNACWG) (Tod Beardsley)**
  - A meeting is scheduled in the near term between Tod and Shannon to discuss an upcoming podcast. The podcast will have basic content about what the CVE Program is and what it does. It will be a reflection on a previous article.

- **Outreach and Communications Working Group (OCWG) (Shannon Sabens)**
  - Coordinating with CNACWG on the upcoming podcast.
  - OCWG would like to be involved with the CNACWG’s mentoring program for new CNAs.

- **Quality Working Group (QWG) (Dave Waltermire)**
  - Working with the web team to work out CVE Record rendering. QWG provided feedback, and AWG is working on updates.

- **Transition Working Group (TWG) (Lisa Olson)**
  - The upcoming workshop structure was discussed at the last TWG meeting.
  - When the workshop will be scheduled is tied to when CVE Services will soft deploy. A better idea about timing is expected in mid-August.

- **Strategic Planning Working Group (SPWG) (Kent Landfield)**
  - The SPWG plans to be back on-line the week of August 15.
A Doodle poll about meeting time/frequency will be used to establish the SPWG meeting schedule. The poll will be distributed by the Secretariat, and Kent will provide the necessary poll information.

The CNA Operational Rules update will be an early group focus.

The SPWG review of the Rules will be the first phase of completing and finalizing the document.

Board Meeting Attendance (Mark Cox)

- A review of prior Board meeting notes showed that several members have not attended a single meeting in 2022, and others only once. It was suggested that the program look into the reasons some Board members are not engaged.

- A two-fold approach will be used:
  - **Action item**: Program Coordination Team will reach out to Board members individually that have poor meeting attendance/program engagement to discuss how to get more participation. Present discussion results to the Board.
  - **Action item**: Secretariat will reach out to the Board with a survey about what can be done to improve Board meetings to foster more engagement.

- Focusing future Board member recruitment efforts on currently engaged program participants (e.g., working group member) may be beneficial, as it demonstrates their engagement (or lack of) with the program.

- There is an annual check-in with Board members to gauge their interest in continuing to be a member. It was recommended that the program initiate more frequent check-ins for members who seem unengaged; for example, no activity in 6 months.

Lunch at Black Hat (Shannon Sabens)

- CVE participants attending Black Hat 2022 are welcome to get together for lunch at Flour and Barley Brick-Oven Pizza, on August 10 at 1:30 pm. Reservation is for 6-10 people. If possible, let Shannon know if you can attend ahead of time.

Status of WG Operations Handbook (Dave Morse)

- Board review comments have been received and will be consolidated and addressed.

- When the next update is ready, it will be sent to the Board list email for a second and final review to ensure members are happy with the updates. This review will start at least one week prior to the next scheduled Board meeting, to allow time for review, and possible vote/consensus at the meeting.

- Target is to send the next update to the Board by August 10.

Open Discussion

- Workshop and Summit
  - The upcoming workshop date(s) depends on the soft and hard deployment schedules. Currently estimated to occur mid to late October.
  - The summit is a separate event, and hopefully can be held in-person.
Need to start discussing summit topics. One important topic will be the changes in CNA operational rules due to CVE Services deployment.

- Given the estimated timing of CVE Services deployment, it is not practical to expect having the summit this calendar year.
- The idea of having the summit in the March/April 2023 timeframe was discussed without disagreement. To meet that, the location and venue need to be identified and scheduled, and the agenda needs to be reasonably firm, by mid-December, giving the program and community participants time to prepare.

**Review of Action Items**

- 11.10.04 – One minor change to the slides will be made, and then the slides will be sent to the Board for review. Still in progress until Board approves.
- 04.27.03 – No blog comments received from OCWG yet. Send the blog to the Board now so they can start their review.
- 05.11.03 – Set up another meeting with interested participants. Art thinks he can continue to support the effort.

**Next CVE Board Meetings**

- Wednesday, August 17, 2022, 2:00pm – 4:00pm (ET)
- Wednesday, August 31, 2022, 9:00am – 11:00am (ET)
- Wednesday, September 14, 2022, 2:00pm – 4:00pm (ET)
- Wednesday, September 28, 2022, 9:00am – 11:00am (ET)
- Wednesday, October 12, 2022, 2:00pm – 4:00pm (ET)

**Discussion Topics for Future Meetings**

- CVE Services 2.1 and CVE Program website transition updates (on-going)
- Summit planning updates
- Working Group updates, every other meeting (next scheduled for August 31)
- Council of Roots meeting highlights (on-going)
- Researcher Working Group proposal for Board review
- Vision Paper and Annual Report
- Initiate Board vote for a proposed solution to allow CNAs to assign IDs for insecure default configuration (from closed action item 03.03.02)
- Resolution on the breakout thread about the year notation in CVE IDs (Tod B) (in-progress)